

Article Analysis 3:

Louis, K. S., Murphy, J., & Smylie, M. (2016). Caring Leadership in Schools: Findings From Exploratory Analyses. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 52(2), 310-348.

Trish Auletta

EDU-7901

Dr. A. Cypres

St. John's University

Caring Leadership in Schools: Findings From Exploratory Analyses

A. How did the authors organize their manuscript so that the reader could understand the information?

It was more difficult for the reader to follow the trail of intent in this article than in some other recent articles. The authors used heavy narrative mixed with occasional citation to introduce their topic (the relationship between caring administrators and student academic learning) and define their terms, and followed by a lengthy literature review that seemed to branch out repeatedly and then retract back to the originally assumed intent.

B. How did the authors go about explaining their rationale for the subject they are exploring?

The authors began the article reminding the reader of the increased academic rigor (press) students are faced with and the supposition that students achieve better academically when they are in nurturing relationships within the school community.

C. How clearly did the authors frame the problem statement?

It was difficult at first for the reader to discover the problem statement amid the initial narrative. Many of the issues raised were discussed repeatedly and the reader's focus was broken creating a need to go back and start over. Eventually (after repeated reading) the reader finds the casually mentioned problem statement at the end of the introduction.

D. How was the research question framed in order to make sense to the reader?

The research questions were located 11 pages into the article. Both questions required repeated reading for clarification.

E. How clearly did the authors link the problem statement and rationale to relevant empirical research?

The casually mentioned problem statement on the second page of the article was repeated throughout, but with a lot of expanding into other areas of concern before returning to the original statement. By the time the reader got to the research questions, re-focus was necessary to make a solid connection between the two.

F. What ways did the authors use to explain how their method(s) are suited to answer the research question?

Methodology was not explicitly detailed. However, the authors explained that the data they used was collected 8 years earlier and for a different purpose. The inference was that this made the data more reliable as it was collected for a different research topic and therefore would not be skewed.

G. How did the authors demonstrate their data analyses?

The authors demonstrated their data analysis through the use of tables, graphs, and graphic organizers.

H. How did the author(s) link the problem statement to the research questions

The link between the problem statements to the research questions appeared weak at best. There were more discussions regarding the limitations presented by the data used than there was regarding empirical findings.

I. Are the conclusions and recommendations valid in your opinion? Defend your answer?

(Why do you think this?)

The reader was not convinced that the data was valid beyond the common sense point that student will do better in environments that support and care for them. There has been no debate this reader has found in this article or elsewhere to suggest otherwise. The data collected was gathered at a different time, when families were more likely to be whole, where one parent was more likely to be home, where academic support (homework help) was available at home as well as in school, and when television and social media were not the level of distractor that they are today.

J. What do you think the authors forgot or ignored?

To this reader's mind, the author's use of outdated survey data that was geared towards different research questions in a totally different social era was an error in judgment. In using this data, the authors forgot the possible influences of single parent households, households in which both parents work, social media, increased tensions between home and school which has created mistrust, and social / litigation issues which have created the need for educators to put personal/social distance between themselves and students